## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

LP MATTHEWS, L.L.C.,	)	
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
	)	
v.	)	C.A. No. 04-1507-SLR
	)	
BATH & BODY WORKS, INC.; LIMITED	)	
BRANDS, INC.; KAO BRANDS CO.	)	
(f/k/a THE ANDREW JERGENS	)	
COMPANY); and KAO CORPORATION,	)	
,	)	
Defendants.	ĺ	

# LP MATTHEWS' DAUBERT MOTION TO STRIKE THE EXPERT REPORT AND EXCLUDE THE TRIAL TESTIMONY OF THE KAO DEFENDANTS' DAMAGES EXPERT

Pursuant to the Scheduling Order entered by this Court on June 9, 2005 (D.I. 39), and as set forth in the accompanying memorandum, plaintiff LP Matthews, L.L.C. moves to strike the expert report, opinions, and proffered trial testimony of Defendants KAO Brands Company's and KAO Corporation's ("Kao defendants") alleged damages expert Dr. G. Stephen Jizmagian.

LP Matthews moves to strike Dr. Jizmagian's report, opinions, and testimony because of the inadequate methodology used by Dr. Jizmagian. Specifically, Dr. Jizmagian fails to apply the *Georgia-Pacific* factors for determining a reasonable royalty and merely repeats a KAO employee's entirely unsupported and self-serving speculation. Dr. Jizmagian's opinion is based on nothing more than pure speculation without underlying proof, classic *ipse dixit* that cannot provide the basis for an admissible expert opinion. Accordingly, Dr. Jizmagian's report and his proposed testimony at trial in this case should be excluded.

The grounds for this motion are more fully set forth in LP Matthews's Opening Memorandum of Law In Support of Its Motion To Strike the Expert Report and Exclude the Trial Testimony of The Kao Defendants' Damages Expert, filed contemporaneously herewith.

#### **ASHBY & GEDDES**

/s/ John G. Day

Steven J. Balick (I.D. #2114) John G. Day (I.D. # 2403) Lauren E. Maguire (I.D. #4261) ASHBY & GEDDES 222 Delaware Avenue, 17th Floor P.O. Box 1150 Wilmington, Delaware 19899 Office: 302-654-1888

Attorneys for Plaintiff LP Matthews, L.L.C.

#### Of Counsel:

Ronald J. Schutz, Esq. Robins, Kaplan, Miller & Ciresi L.L.P. 2800 LaSalle Plaza 800 LaSalle Avenue Minneapolis, MN 55402-2015 Office: 800-553-9910

Robert A. Auchter, Esq.
Jason R. Buratti, Esq.
Robins, Kaplan, Miller & Ciresi L.L.P.
1801 K Street, Suite 1200
Washington, D.C. 20006
Office: 202-775-0725

Dated: June 22, 2006

170669.1

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the 22<sup>nd</sup> day of June, 2006, the attached LP MATTHEWS'

### DAUBERT MOTION TO STRIKE THE EXPERT REPORT AND EXCLUDE THE

TRIAL TESTIMONY OF THE KAO DEFENDANTS' DAMAGES EXPERT was served

upon the below-named counsel of record at the address and in the manner indicated:

Richard L. Horwitz, Esquire Potter Anderson & Corroon, LLP Hercules Plaza, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor 1313 North Market Street P.O. Box 951 Wilmington, DE 19899-0951

HAND DELIVERY

Arthur I. Neustadt, Esquire Oblon, Spivak, McClelland, Maier & Neustadt, P.C. 1940 Duke Street Alexandria, VA 22314

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

Francis G.X. Pileggi, Esquire Fox Rothschild LLP **Suite 1300** 919 North Market Street Wilmington, DE 19899

HAND DELIVERY

John Ward, Esquire Ward & Olivo 708 Third Avenue New York, NY 10017

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

/s/ John G. Day John G. Day